

DRAFT
PRESBYTERY OF MIDDLE TENNESSEE
MINUTES OF ONE HUNDRED THIRTY-NINTH STATED MEETING
OCTOBER 17, 2019

The 139th Stated Meeting of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee was held on Thursday, October 17, 2019, at Second Presbyterian Church, Nashville, Tennessee. Stated Clerk Therese Howell led an orientation and time of prayer for first time commissioners. Moderator John Hinkle, Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

WORSHIP

Worship was led by David Williams, Clee Lee, and Rev. Nolan Huizenga (Second Presbyterian Church). The sermon was preached by Rev. Yolanda M. Norton (Assistant Professor of Hebrew Bible and H. Eugene Farlough Chair of Black Church Studies at San Francisco Theological Seminary, University of Redlands Graduate School of Theology). The adult choir of Second Presbyterian Church, led by Jeanette MacCallum, Director of Music Ministry, and Organist, Douglas Murray. The offering was collected for Presbyterian Disaster Assistance.

DECLARATION OF QUORUM / STATEMENT OF PROCEDURES / WELCOME BY HOST / FIRST TIME COMMISSIONERS / CORRESPONDING MEMBERS

The meeting reconvened after worship; the Moderator declared a quorum was present and reviewed procedures for the meeting. Dr. Mary Louise McCullough, pastor of the host church, welcomed commissioners to Second. First time commissioners to presbytery were recognized and welcomed.

The Presbytery's Mission and Operations Manual and the *Book of Order* provide for the seating of corresponding members and teaching and ruling elders with voice and those with voice and vote. Any ruling elder serving as presbytery's Moderator, Vice-Moderator, Moderator-in-Nomination, chairs of committees, members of the Administrative Committee, members of the Finance Committee, and the Moderator of Presbyterian Women, are enrolled as members of presbytery and shall have voice and vote. Ruling elders commissioned to particular pastoral service, and ruling elders who have previously served as presbytery moderator, within five years of completion of his/her term of service, are enrolled as members of presbytery with voice and vote. Any ruling elder serving as a committee representative to a particular meeting of presbytery in the absence of the chair shall have the privilege of voice and vote for that particular meeting of the presbytery. Persons certified in church service who are ruling elders shall have the privilege of voice and vote at all meetings of the presbytery, during their term of service in ministry in the presbytery of Middle Tennessee. Persons certified in church service, who are members of congregations in the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee, shall have the privilege of voice at all meetings of the presbytery during their term of service in a congregation or other ministry validated by the presbytery. Should a question arise concerning the enrollment of any person, the presbytery may resolve the matter upon the recommendation of the Permanent Judicial Commission. Corresponding members were seated without objection, and are listed with the roll.

ROLL

The roll of commissioners, corresponding members, and visitors attending the presbytery meeting is attached (Attachment A).

AGENDA

The Moderator stated that the agenda for the meeting had been provided in advance to commissioners. The Moderator reported there were additional items of business from the Committee on Ministry, including commissioning a ruling elder to pastoral service. The motion to set aside the standing rules to act upon the additional items of business was made and seconded. The following agenda was approved by the necessary three-quarters vote of commissioners:

- | | | |
|----------|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 8:30 am | 1. | Registration (Order of the Day in CAPS) |
| 9:00 am | | Orientation for First Time Commissioners and Prayer for Presbytery – (20 min) |
| 9:30 am | 2. | CALL TO ORDER / WORSHIP
(Offering: Presbyterian Disaster Assistance) |
| 10:30 am | 3. | Break |
| 10:45 am | 4. | Reconvene / Establishment of Quorum / Statement of Procedures / Welcome by Host
/ Recognition of First Time Presbyters / Seating of Corresponding Members /
Adoption of Agenda |
| 11:00 am | 5. | Stated Clerk’s Report – Therese Howell (5 minutes) |
| 11:05 am | 6. | Administrative Committee – Theresa Denton (15 min) <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Personnel Task Force• Nominating Task Force |
| 11:20 am | 7. | Finance Committee – Mike Ingram (5 minutes) |
| 11:25 am | 8. | Hunger Action Advocate Report – Stuart Wilson-Patton (5 min) |
| 11:30 am | 9. | Prayer of Thanksgiving / Lunch |
| 12:30 pm | | Reconvene |
| | 10. | Youth Triennium Report – Linzi Anderson (5 min) |
| 12:35 pm | 11. | NaCoMe Camp and Conference Center Report – Ryan Moore (5 min) |
| 12:40 pm | 12. | Committee on Ministry – Stephen Yates (25 min) |
| 1:05 pm | 13. | Nueva Vida Report – Teddy Chiquimia (10 min) |
| 1:15 pm | 14. | Trinity Oversight Committee Report – Allen Kennedy (20 min) |
| 1:35 pm | 15. | Co-Executive Presbyters’ Report – Robin and Ray Thomas (10 min) |
| 1:45 pm | 16. | Concerns, Celebrations, and Announcements – Thomases (10 min) |
| 1:55 pm | 17. | Unfinished Business |
| | | 140th Stated Meeting – Saturday, February 1, 2020, location to be determined |
| 2:00 pm | 18. | Closing Prayer / Adjourn |

REPORT OF THE STATED CLERK

Ruling Elder Therese Howell, Stated Clerk, presented the following report.

Meredith Cox / Ordination

The Stated Clerk has received the minutes of the commission to ordain Meredith Cox to the Ministry of the Word and Sacrament. *[minutes to be included in permanent record]*

Whitney Booth Lockard / Ordination

The Stated Clerk has received the minutes of the commission to ordain Whitney Booth Lockard to the Ministry of the Word and Sacrament. *[minutes to be included in permanent record]*

Len Carrell / First Presbyterian Church, Columbia

The Stated Clerk has received the minutes of the commission to install Rev. Len Carrell as Pastor of First Presbyterian Church, Columbia. *[minutes to be included in permanent record]*

Jooyoung Hong / Inquirer

The Committee on Preparation for Ministry reported that Jooyoung Hong (Nashville Korean Presbyterian Church) was received as an inquirer under care of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee as of August 20, 2019.

UKIRK Nashville / Communion

The Stated Clerk received a request to allow UKIRK Nashville to celebrate the sacrament of communion during 2020; Rev. Lindsay Groves will preside. The motion was made, seconded, and approved without objection.

Minutes of the 138th Stated Meeting (July 20, 2019)

The Stated Clerk presented the minutes of the 138th Stated Meeting (July 20, 2019) of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee for approval. The motion was made and seconded to approve the minutes. After corrections, the minutes were approved as amended.

HANDLSON v. THE PRESBYTERY OF MIDDLE TENNESSEE

The Stated Clerk received the decision of the General Assembly Permanent Judicial Commission in the remedial complaint Handlson v. The Presbytery of Middle Tennessee. A summary of the decision was presented; following is the complete decision of the General Assembly Permanent Judicial Decision.

**THE PERMANENT JUDICIAL COMMISSION
OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY
OF THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH (U.S.A.)**

Patrick Handlson, Appellant,)	
)	
v.)	Decision and Order
)	Remedial Appeal 224-07
Presbytery of Middle Tennessee, Appellee.)	
)	

Arrival Statement

This is an appeal to the General Assembly Permanent Judicial Commission (GAPJC or this Commission) from a decision in a remedial case tried by the Permanent Judicial Commission of the Synod of Living Waters (SPJC) on January 10, 2019. In that decision, the SPJC reversed in part and affirmed in part actions of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee (Appellee or Presbytery) in response to a complaint of Patrick Handlson (Appellant). Appellant appealed the SPJC’s decision to the GAPJC.

Jurisdictional Statement

This Commission has jurisdiction, Appellant has standing to file this appeal, the appeal was properly and timely filed, and the appeal states one or more of the grounds for appeal under D-8.0105.¹

Appearances

Neal Lloyd and Jamie Bibee Lloyd appeared as counsel on behalf of Appellant. Hunter Brush and Terry Epling, committee of counsel, appeared on behalf of Appellee.

History

This case arises as an appeal from a decision of the SPJC by Appellant, a minister member of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee under censure of temporary exclusion from the exercise of ordered ministry.

In May 2016, the Presbytery received statements alleging Appellant engaged in sexual misconduct and communications of a sexual nature. An investigating committee was appointed, and the committee and Appellant negotiated an alternative form of resolution prior to a trial by the Presbytery Permanent Judicial Commission (PPJC). The PPJC accepted Appellant’s guilty plea at trial on September 29, 2016, and ordered the agreed-upon censure. The PPJC censure reads:

¹ *Book of Order* citations in this Decision are from the 2017–2019 edition, which was in effect during the time of the actions and SPJC decision herein.

The [Presbytery]... does now declare you temporarily excluded from the office of teaching elder for a period of six months beginning October 1, 2016, and the completion of the following actions:

1. Your pastoral relationship with First Presbyterian Church, Cookeville [FPCC], will be dissolved pursuant to D-12.0104f and G-2.0904, Presbytery (acting through its Permanent Judicial Commission) having determined that the church's mission under the Word imperatively demands it. The exact timing and manner of implementing this decision left to the Committee on Ministry [COM], in consultation with the session of First Presbyterian Church, Cookeville.
2. You must cooperate with the Committee on Ministry in informing the congregation of First Presbyterian Church, Cookeville, that you are in full agreement with the decision to dissolve the pastoral relationship, and that this decision is in the best interest of all concerned, especially the congregation. You must inform them of your guilty plea and your desire to allow them to make a fresh start and begin the healing process without the divisions and distractions caused by the disciplinary proceeding.
3. You must receive counseling for a period of not less than one year. Presbytery will determine the adequacy of your treatment program and will have the discretion to arrange alternative counseling or psychological/psychiatric treatment to ensure that your counselor or therapist is fully qualified by training and experience to provide the needed counseling and therapy.
4. You will be temporarily excluded from the exercise of ordered ministry for a period of six months beginning on October 1, 2016.
5. As an act of grace, Presbytery will arrange for the payment of the costs of your health insurance to the Board of Pensions during the period of your temporary exclusion from ordered ministry if those costs are not covered by a severance package from First Presbyterian Church, Cookeville.
6. Upon the expiration of your period of temporary exclusion you will retire from active ministry as a Teaching Elder. You would not be allowed to perform any of the functions of ordered ministry following your retirement unless Presbytery approves your restoration pursuant to D-12.0104h.
7. Your retirement status will be determined by the Presbytery, based upon the recommendation of its Committee on Ministry. Your plea to the above charges will not preclude you from being classified as honorably retired if you demonstrate appropriate repentance and rehabilitation. You will be allowed to address Presbytery concerning your repentance and rehabilitation before it makes that decision.

A COM care team, which was established to deal with matters related to the PPJC decision, met with Appellant on a periodic basis. Appellant also was receiving counseling from a qualified counselor and therapist.

Appellant requested restoration to ordered ministry on March 29, 2017, six months after the decision; the COM denied that request and appointed a new care team. The COM also advised Appellant to apply to the Board of Pensions for retired status on June 1, 2017.

The COM considered Appellant's second request for restoration on September 12, 2017, following favorable reports from the counselor and the care team. The COM required counseling through the end of the calendar year and agreed to recommend Presbytery approval of Appellant's request for restoration and honorable retirement at its February 2018 meeting.

The COM reported to the Presbytery on February 3, 2018, recommending that Appellant be restored to the active roll of ministers of the Word and Sacrament and that he be granted status of honorably retired. Appellant addressed the Presbytery, answered questions from the floor, and was excused from the room during the subsequent debate and voting. The Presbytery defeated the COM's recommendation in a single vote that combined the actions on restoration and retirement status ("the first matter"). The Presbytery then considered a "second matter" and adopted the following motion without Appellant present in the room:

In order to establish a process for the Presbytery and Mr. Handlson to move forward, if he so desires, Mr. Handlson can renew his request for reinstatement every 24 months provided the following:

1. that he can show continued work toward healing and health through things like counseling, getting a support group, participating in a church;
2. that he continue to abide by the restrictions placed upon him through his guilty plea and abide by the presbytery's Former Pastor Policy;
3. that he submit written reports of his work toward healing and health every six months to the presbytery's Committee on Ministry; and
4. that there be no more incidents of misconduct on his part.

And that if Mr. Handlson desires for this body to reconsider the decision that has been made today, his request will come through the Stated Clerk of the Presbytery; and all of the documents provided at this meeting, including the victim's impact statement, as well as any other documents that the Committee on Ministry believes is important for this council to consider, will be included in the packet from the presbytery prior to the meeting.

Appellant filed a remedial complaint alleging three irregularities by the Presbytery in taking its February 3, 2018, actions. The SPJC preliminary order accepted two irregularities for trial. The SPJC trial was conducted on January 10, 2019, resulting in a decision that upheld the Presbytery's actions in all respects except for its requirement that Appellant wait twenty-four months between requests for restoration. The SPJC observed, "[W]hile the wording of the original censure is inartful in its implementation of both a definite time period *and* a supervised rehabilitation process (when the Rules of Discipline call for one or the other), the exclusion was clearly intended to be temporary, not permanent, and the Presbytery's leadership is urged to help the Presbytery move forward in a manner that gives effect to the censure's intent."

On February 18, 2019, Appellant filed a notice of appeal with the GAPJC, which heard oral arguments on October 11, 2019.

Specifications of Error

Specification of Error No. 1: The SPJC erred in constitutional interpretation (D-8.0105g) by failing to find in the first matter that the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee erred:

1. *when it failed to follow the recommendation of its Committee on Ministry to restore Appellant to the active roll of ministers and grant him honorably retired status, thus not following the terms of the PPJC censure;*
2. *when it combined granting of honorably retired status with restoring to the exercise of ordered ministry; and*
3. *when it applied flawed process and criteria in assessing Appellant's repentance and rehabilitation.*

This specification of error is sustained.

Following a finding of guilt in a disciplinary case against a minister of the Word and Sacrament, it is the responsibility of a presbytery PJC to impose a censure. This censure is not subject to change or further interpretation by the presbytery as a whole. (See *Presbytery of Muskingum Valley v. Hauser*, 222-06, 2015.)

The responsibility of a presbytery is to enforce the censure as issued by the PJC, seeking to give it full effect while not perpetuating constitutional errors, particularly when there is confusion or ambiguity within the censure. According to D-12.0104a, a censure of temporary exclusion from the exercise of ordered ministry may be “for a definite period of time, **or** for a period defined by completion of supervised rehabilitation” (emphasis added). However, the censure in this case contained **both** a length of time (six months) and required actions (seven listed items) as requirements to be fulfilled. In addition, the various elements of the censure seem contradictory with one another and/or within themselves. Because the censure was not appealed, it became the final determination of the Presbytery in the matter.

A plain reading of the censure indicates that Appellant’s temporary exclusion was intended to last for six months, as was reiterated in No. 4 of the required actions. As Appellee acknowledged in oral argument, Appellant also fulfilled the censure’s required elements Nos. 1, 2, 3, and 6. No. 5 of the censure was a requirement for the Presbytery, not the Appellant.

The final element, No. 7 in the censure’s list, provides a procedure for the Presbytery to determine Appellant’s “retirement status.” The Presbytery erred in conflating Appellant’s restoration to the exercise of ordered ministry with considering his retirement status. Nothing about the language of the censure suggests the Presbytery is to exercise its own judgment about Appellant’s readiness for restoration to ordered ministry on the basis of his repentance. The Presbytery’s effort to do so constituted an error and an injustice to the Appellant.

A presbytery is ill-suited to make a determination, through a floor debate, of a particular person’s repentance. Sessions and PJC’s are advised to impose censures with specific and measurable provisions, rather than requiring the council to conduct subjective evaluations in plenary session.

However, the censure in the instant case required the Presbytery to make such a determination in order to act on Appellant’s retirement status. The censure assigned the COM the responsibility for making a recommendation. The record reflects that the COM considered assessments by its own care teams as well as a qualified counselor assigned by the Presbytery and recommended restoration and honorable retirement. The Presbytery declined to approve that recommendation. In most cases, a presbytery would be well served by showing deference to those with the greatest expertise and/or closest proximity to the situation.

G-12.0104h² says, “The council that imposed the censure shall approve the restoration when the time of exclusion has expired or when the council is fully satisfied that the supervised rehabilitation pronounced has been completed.” In this case, the Presbytery was unable to articulate any way in which the prescribed censure has not been completely fulfilled. While a presbytery may determine whether a temporarily excluded individual is to be granted “honorably retired” status, this Commission reminds the Presbytery of the ruling in *Veldhuizen & Yoshioka v. Presbytery of San Francisco* (209-2, 3; 1997): “We also hold that it is inappropriate for a presbytery to withhold the status of Honorably Retired from ministers or to place them on the inactive roll as a means of discipline.”

Specification of Error No. 2: The SPJC erred in constitutional interpretation (D-8.0105g) by failing to find in the second matter that the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee failed to show fundamental fairness and

² This reference cited by the GAPJC is incorrect; the correct citation is D-12.0104h.

protect Appellant's due process rights by conducting a debate and vote on an issue concerning Appellant without informing him or inviting him to be present for the debate or to speak on his own behalf.

This specification of error is sustained.

Authoritative interpretations (AIs) of the Form of Government have long recognized that ministers of the Word and Sacrament under temporary exclusion from the exercise of ordered ministry are still members of presbytery. An AI in 1994 classified them as "inactive members." Although that category no longer exists in the Form of Government, the privileges and limitations afforded to temporarily excluded ministers of the Word and Sacrament remain the same; namely, they are not "entitled to take part in the meetings of the presbytery or to speak, vote, hold office, or serve on committees, except that the inactive member may speak when the matter under consideration concerns that minister." (*Minutes*, 1994, Part I, p. 203). That AI goes on to reiterate, "a minister temporarily excluded from exercise of ordained office may speak at presbytery meetings on matters relating to himself or herself." We hold that this authoritative interpretation remains in effect as an interpretation of D-12.0104d and D-12.0104e.

In the instant case, Appellant was permitted to speak on the first matter relating to his application for restoration. He was excused before the full discussion and vote in keeping with the custom of the Presbytery, although this Commission finds that there is no constitutional or parliamentary requirement for a presbyter to leave in such a situation. But having left the room for the first vote, Appellant should have been immediately informed of the initial vote and invited back in the room as soon as the second matter was introduced. Consideration of this second matter, the evidence shows, clearly contained proposals and discussion related to Appellant. This Commission maintains that he had a right to be present and to speak on matters pertaining to him.

Fundamental fairness requires allowing the voices of those potentially affected by a decision to be heard. It is a protection the church grants throughout its polity, and explicitly so for those facing decisions regarding their temporary exclusion from the exercise of ordered ministry. The action of the Presbytery, in this case, blatantly violated that principle.

Specification of Error No. 3: The SPJC erred in constitutional interpretation (D-8.0105g) by failing to find that the entirety of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee's action on the second matter at its February 3, 2019, meeting amounted to an unconstitutional amendment of the PPJC censure.

This specification of error is sustained.

In a disciplinary case involving a minister of the Word and Sacrament, it is the exclusive responsibility of a PJC to impose a censure, as noted under Specification of Error No. 1. This censure is not subject to amendment by the council as a whole (*The Presbytery of Muskingum Valley v. Robert A. Hauser*, 222-06, 2015). Rather, the council is responsible for "ongoing enforcement" of the censure as issued by the PJC.

This Commission finds that the language of the Presbytery's action in the second matter is an amendment to the original censure. The approved motion goes beyond requiring the twenty-four-month waiting period between requests for restoration that was struck down by the SPJC. It also requires "continued work toward healing and health through things like counseling, getting a support group, participating in the church"; additional written reports to the Committee on Ministry; and new expectations regarding the avoidance of additional misconduct. These constitute additional requirements beyond those found in the original PPJC censure and not merely "ongoing enforcement" of that censure. Such a practice undermines the fairness of the church's disciplinary process by diminishing the exclusive authority of a PJC to impose a censure. This action, in its entirety, was a violation of the Constitution.

Of particular concern was this element of the Presbytery's action: "If Mr. Handlson desires for this body to reconsider the decision that has been made today... all of the documents provided at this meeting, including the victim's impact statement... will be included in the packet from the presbytery prior to the meeting." This Commission holds that this action is an inappropriate use of the victim impact statement contemplated in D-11.0403e, which is intended for use only in the formulation of a censure following a finding of guilt. Its continued use may re-victimize those harmed by an offense and impair the council's future ability to assess an individual's repentance.

Decision

Concluding a temporary exclusion from the exercise of ordered ministry is an important, though difficult, responsibility of councils. As in all matters of church discipline, the purpose is to manifest our shared responsibility "for building up the body of Christ, not for destroying it, for redeeming, not for punishing" (D-1.0102). In this case, the Presbytery's actions fell short of this ideal.

Councils are encouraged to be extremely attentive to the details of their responsibilities under D-12.0104h. When crafting censures in disciplinary cases or when approving settlement agreements, sessions and PJs are to abide by the Rules of Discipline, imposing temporary exclusion "for a definite period of time, **or** for a period defined by completion of supervised rehabilitation..." (D-12.0104h, emphasis added). Requirements for supervised rehabilitation should be clear and easily understood, without contradictions within the censure, allowing councils to objectively determine if the terms of a censure have been fulfilled. A council has the responsibility to effect restoration when the requirements of supervised rehabilitation have been completed (or earlier in accordance with D-12.0104i).

This case involves an egregious example of sexual misconduct. The Rules of Discipline establish a process for disciplinary cases to address such misconduct. While some might question the adequacy of the PPJC decision, the Constitution clearly assigns to the permanent judicial commission the responsibility for determination of a censure. For a presbytery to impose its will by amending the censure is outside the bounds of the Rules of Discipline.

All are encouraged to undertake every aspect of their discernment in disciplinary situations with attention to the principles stated in D-1.0101:

The purpose of discipline is to honor God by making clear the significance of membership in the body of Christ; to preserve the purity of the church by nourishing the individual within the life of the believing community; to achieve justice and compassion for all participants involved; to correct or restrain wrongdoing in order to bring members to repentance and restoration; to uphold the dignity of those who have been harmed by disciplinary offenses; to restore the unity of the church by removing the causes of discord and division; and to secure the just, speedy, and economical determination of proceedings. In all respects, all participants are to be accorded procedural safeguards and due process, and it is the intention of these rules so to provide.

Order

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the decision of the Synod of Living Waters Permanent Judicial Commission is hereby reversed.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that all actions regarding Patrick Handlson by the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee at its meeting on February 3, 2018, are set aside and are to be considered null and void.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee consider again the Committee on Ministry recommendation (on restoring Mr. Handlson to active ministry and on granting him honorably

retired status) at its next meeting, but no sooner than thirty days from this Decision, voting separately on restoration and on his retirement status, and taking actions consistent with this Decision and Order.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Stated Clerk of the Synod of Living Waters report this Decision to the Synod of Living Waters at the first meeting after receipt, that the Synod of Living Waters enter the full Decision upon its minutes, and that an excerpt from those minutes showing entry of the Decision be sent to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Stated Clerk of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee report this Decision to the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee at the first meeting after receipt, that the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee enter the full Decision upon its minutes, and that an excerpt from those minutes showing entry of the Decision be sent to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly.

Absences and Non-Appeances

Commissioners Jean Kennedy and June L. Lorenzo were absent and did not participate in the hearing or deliberations. The commissioner position from the Synod of the Northeast was vacant.

Concurring Opinion

While I concur with the decision, I have reservations with the portion of the analysis under Specification of Error No. 3 dealing with the use of the victim impact statement. Although the language used by the majority assumes that a victim impact statement is written, I am concerned that the language could be read to preclude any reference whatsoever by the victim concerning the harm caused by a minister who has engaged in sexual misconduct. While the disciplinary rules seek “to bring members to repentance and restoration,” they also seek “to achieve justice and compassion for all participants involved” (D-1.0101). In bringing a member to repentance and restoration, we can never forget the victims.

_____/s/_____
Diana Moore
October 14, 2019

Concurring Opinion

We concur with the Decision of this Commission. We further concur with the concurring opinion by Commissioner Moore. However, we have additional comments regarding the last two sentences of the analysis under Specification of Error No. 3 dealing with the use of victim impact statements.

This Decision holds that victim impact statement “is intended for use only in the formulation of a censure following a finding of guilt.” This would prohibit the statement presented to a PJC from being utilized to assess an individual’s degree of repentance.

The sharing of a victim impact statement is not prohibited in D-11.0403e and should be the individual right of the victim to allow or disallow the use of the statement. With the victim’s agreement, the statement should be made available to the therapist of the offending individual in cases where rehabilitation or counseling is part of the censure. This information is very valuable to counselors and therapists when determining whether a particular individual has been successfully rehabilitated and/or is repentant.

_____/s/_____
Maurice R. Caskey

_____/s/_____
Mari Glory González-Guerra

_____/s/_____
Linda Windy Johnston

_____/s/_____
James C. Pak
October 14, 2019

Certificate

We certify that the foregoing is a true and correct copy of the Decision of the Permanent Judicial Commission of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) in Remedial Case 224-07, Patrick Handlson, Appellant, v. Presbytery of Middle Tennessee, Appellee, made and announced at Louisville, Kentucky, this 14th day of October, 2019.

Dated this 14th day of October, 2019.

/s/
Ruth Goldthwaite, Moderator
Permanent Judicial Commission of the General Assembly

/s/
Deborah Little Cohn, Clerk
Permanent Judicial Commission of the General Assembly

I certify that I did transmit a certified copy of the foregoing to the following persons by Federal Express Next Day Air, directing Flor Vélez-Díaz to deposit it in the mail at Louisville, Kentucky, this 14th day of October, 2019.

- Patrick Handlson, Appellant
- Neal Lloyd and Jamie Bibee Lloyd, Counsel for Appellant
- Hunter Brush and Terry Epling, Counsel for Appellee
- Stated Clerk, Presbytery of Middle Tennessee
- Stated Clerk, Synod of Living Waters

I further certify that I did transmit a certified copy of the foregoing to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) by delivering it in person to Flor Vélez-Díaz, on October 14, 2019.

/s/
Deborah Little Cohn, Clerk
Permanent Judicial Commission of the General Assembly

I certify that I received a certified copy of the foregoing, that it is a full and correct copy of the decision of the Permanent Judicial Commission of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), sitting during an interval between meetings of the General Assembly, in Louisville, Kentucky, on October 14, 2019, in Remedial Case 224-07, Patrick Handlson, Appellant, v. Presbytery of Middle Tennessee, Appellee, and that it is the final judgment of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) in the case.

Dated at Louisville, Kentucky, on October 14, 2019.

/s/
Flor Vélez-Díaz
Assistant Stated Clerk of the General Assembly,
Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)
and Manager of Judicial Process and Social Witness

ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

Ruling Elder Theresa Denton, Vice-Moderator and chair of the Administrative Committee, presented the committee’s report.

Trinity Oversight Committee

The Administrative Committee received a final report from the Trinity Oversight Committee, and concurred with its recommendations.

2020 Presbytery Meeting Dates

The Administrative committee approved the following presbytery meeting dates for 2020: Saturday, February 1; Thursday, May 21; Saturday, July 18; Thursday, October 15.

October 17, 2019 Presbytery Meeting

The Administrative Committee approved the worship plans for the October 17 Presbytery meeting. The Rev. Yolanda Norton, Assistant Professor of Hebrew Bible, H. Eugene Farlough Professor of Black Church Studies at San Francisco Theological Seminary/University of Redlands Graduate School of Theology, will preach, and the offering will be collected for Presbyterian Disaster Assistance. The general outline of the agenda was approved; the Moderator, Vice-Moderator, Moderator-in-Nomination, Co-Executive Presbyters, and Stated Clerk were authorized to approve the final agenda.

Terms of Service

The Administrative Committee discussed terms of service, and clarified that the six year term limit, as stated in the Mission and Operations Manual, would apply.

Nominating Task Force

The Administrative Committee received updates from the Nominating Task Force. A slate of nominees is provided with this report.

Personnel Task Force Report

The Administrative Committee received a report from the Personnel Task Force. The task force has revised the Presbytery's Personnel Policies; the revisions are included with this report.

Erin Dolman has been hired as the Administrative Assistant, effective July 24. She has a dual degree in communications and public relations, and experience in website work and WordPress.

The Personnel Task Force evaluated the Stated Clerk, Therese Howell, and recommends her re-election as stated clerk, for a three-year term.

Policy Revisions

The Administrative Committee approved the revision of the Presbytery's Sexual Misconduct Policy and Crisis Communication Policy, as well as the creation of a child and youth protection policy. Ray and Robin Thomas will recruit persons to assist with these policies.

First Presbyterian Church, Franklin / Utility Easement

The Administrative Committee approved the sale of property by First Presbyterian Church, Franklin, for a utility easement. The property is in two parcels, totaling 6/100 of an acre, and will be sold to Mallory Valley Utility District for \$9,000.

Nominating Task Force Report

Rev. David Sawyer, chair of the Nominating Task Force, presented a slate of nominees. The floor was opened for additional nominations, and those nominations received a second. There were no further nominations, and the following slate was approved [*All nominees are to the class of 2022, unless otherwise indicated*]:

RE Cristi Scott Ligon, St. Andrews, Moderator-in-Nomination
RE Steve Douse, First Nashville, Treasurer

Administrative Committee

TE Greg Glover, First Clarksville (Class of 2021)
TE Mary Louise McCullough, Second

Finance

TE Evelyn Graham, Southminster
RE Melinda Sanders, Woodland

Church Transformation

RE Bob LaGrone, First Nashville (Class of 2021)
TE Lilia Rameriz-Jimenez, UMC
TE Chris Adams, First Spring Hill

Leadership Excellence

TE Jonathan Angel, Allardt
RE Dr. Mary Martin, First Murfreesboro

Committee on Ministry

TE Beth McCaw, Telos at Southminster (Class of 2020)
TE Gary Kelly, Honorably Retired (Class of 2021)
RE Debra VanDerVeer, Historic Franklin
TE Nolan Huizenga, Second
TE Allen Cross, First Shelbyville
RE Jim Petersen, First Franklin
TE Cindy Schwartz, Priest Lake
TE Leslie Traylor, Hermitage

Mutual Support

TE Josh Rodriguez, First Nashville (Think Tank)
TE Mary Sellers Shaw, First Franklin (Campus Ministries)
RE Vicky McMillen, First Dickson (Youth)

Committee on Preparation for Ministry

RE Kate Adcock, Second (Class of 2021)
TE Michael McLaughlin, First Cookeville
RE Andrew Smith, Blue Spring Sparta
TE Mike Wilson, Downtown

Permanent Judicial Commission

RE Bill Carver, First Franklin (Class of 2024)
RE Christi Enschede, Historic Franklin (Class of 2024)

UKIRK Nashville Board

Chair, Rachel Penmore, Westminster, 2020
Vice-Chair, Nolan Huizenga, Second, 2021
Treasurer, Guy Hicks, Westminster, 2020
Outreach Chair, Kate Workman, alumni, 2021
Secretary, Montgomery Williams, Westminster, 2021
Dinner Coordinator, Jody Kelly, Hillsboro, 2020
Stacy Rector, Member at Large, 2021
Mary Sellers Shaw, First Franklin, 2021
Samera Zavaro, Downtown, 2022
Josh Rodriguez, First Nashville, 2022
Kip Rush, Cumberland Presbyterian Church, 2022
Christie Kelly, Westminster, 2022
Ryan Fox, First Franklin, 2022

2020 Committee Chairs

Administrative	TE Chris Joiner, First Franklin (by virtue of office)
Finance	RE Steve Douse, First Nashville (by virtue of office)
Church Transformation	TE Chris Adams, First Spring Hill
Leadership Excellence	TE Sally Hughes, Trinity
Committee on Ministry	RE Donna Simpson, First Cookeville
Mutual Support	RE Stuart Wilson-Patton, Second
Preparation for Ministry	TE Michael Wilson, Downtown

Commissioners to 224th General Assembly (2020)

Teaching Elders

Heidi Hudnut-Beumler, Westminster Nashville

Chris Joiner, First Franklin

Michael Wilson, Downtown Nashville

Ruling Elders

Theresa Denton, Emmanuel

Connie Hamblen, Eastminster

Geoff Lackey, First Spring Hill

Young Adult Advisory Delegate

Austin Fiala, First Tullahoma

Amendments to Personnel Policies

Dr. Rik Rouquie, a member of the Personnel Task Force, presented the task force's report. The Administrative Committee, upon recommendation of the Personnel Task Force, recommended the following changes to the Personnel Policies, to conform with the Board of Pensions and for clarification. There were no discussion, and the following amendments were approved (text to be deleted is indicated by ~~striketrough~~; text to be added is underlined):

Page 2, Line 43: ADDENDUM (*Position Descriptions*)

Page 3, Line 16:

The presbytery has the following classes of employees including elected (G-3.0104), called, hourly, interim, and temporary-:

- 1) Employees working 20 or more hours per week (2)
 - a) Employees prior to January 1, 2019 receiving full benefits:
More than 20 but less than 31 hours per week:
*Stated Clerk
 - b) Employees after January 1, 2019 receiving no benefits:
More than 20 hours but less 31
None
 - c) Employees 32 to 35 hours per week receiving full benefits:
*Co-Executive Presbyter
- 2) Employees working less than 20 hours per week (1) – eligible for self-funded benefits:
*Administrative Assistant
- 3) Installed pastors (0)
None
- 4) Ministers of the Word and Sacrament working 20 or more hours per week (1)
 - a) 32 to 35 hours per week receiving full benefits:
*Co-Executive Presbyter
- 5) Minister of the Word and Sacrament working less than 20 hours per week (0)
none

Page 3, Line 19:

Stated Clerk:

Per the Book of Order, the presbytery elects a Stated Clerk. Benefits received are medical, death, disability, and pension through the Board of Pensions, and reimbursement for some professional expenses.

Executive Presbyter(s):

The presbytery also has an ~~Executive Presbyter~~ Co-Executive Presbyter(s), a called position. The terms of employment and benefits of the Co-Executive Presbyter(s) shall be defined in the call. **Throughout the remaining document, “Co-Executive Presbyter(s)” replaces “Executive Presbyter.”**

Page 3, Line 32, Hourly Staff:

The Co-Executive Presbyter(s) and a member of the Personnel Task Force will recruit, interview, and select persons for hourly positions to be approved by the Personnel Task Force. Position descriptions will be recommended by Personnel Task Force to the Administrative Committee for approval. All employees are eligible for some Board of Pension benefits through self-funded participation. Benefits and terms of employment will be defined in each position description. Any changes in the requirements and/or hourly expectation could require change in benefits. The position opening will be posted including throughout the presbytery.

Page 3, Line 42, Interim Employees (Transitional called or elected employees):

To provide continuity of administrative and/or program services, the Administrative Committee may authorize the Co-Executive Presbyter(s) and/or the Personnel Task Force, or an appointed search team, to select interim staff to fill vacant positions until the position is filled. Benefits and terms of employment will be defined in each position description.

Page 6, Line 30, Annual Vacation:

Hourly Staff: The length of vacation is determined by the length of service. After one year of ~~full-time~~ service, ~~10 working days with~~ two weeks of equivalent pay are granted. After two years of service, ~~15 days~~ three weeks of equivalent pay are earned.

Election of Stated Clerk

Dr. Rouquie stated the Administrative Committee, upon recommendation of the Personnel Task Force, recommended Ruling Elder Therese Howell be re-elected to a three-year term as stated clerk. Dr. Rouquie reported on the very positive evaluation of Ms. Howell.

Ms. Howell left the meeting, and Rev. Robert Montgomery served as clerk pro tem.

Dr. Rouquie spoke to the motion, and reported on the evaluation process. He stated Personnel included a 3% raise for the stated clerk. There was no discussion; the motion was approved and directed to the Administrative Committee for processing of benefits and salary.

Ms. Howell rejoined the meeting and resumed service as stated clerk.

FINANCE COMMITTEE REPORT

Ruling Elder Mike Ingram, Treasurer and chair of the Finance Committee, presented the committee's report. He reported the Finance Committee met monthly in conjunction with the Administrative Committee.

Financials

The Finance Committee provided financials as of August 31, 2019 with the Presbytery packet, and an analysis of the Presbytery's financials was provided at registration. Mr. Ingram briefly reviewed the financials.

Nueva Vida Financials

The Finance and Administrative Committees reviewed a financial statement from the Nueva Vida new church development.

2018 Audit

The Finance and Administrative Committees reviewed a preliminary draft of the 2018 audit. Completion is awaiting a newly adopted FASB-required liquidity disclosure, which is being drafted.

2020 Budget

The Finance Committee, in conjunction with the Administrative Committee, reviewed a preliminary draft of the 2020 budget. Reductions are recommended, and a final budget will be recommended for approval at the February 1, 2020 Presbytery meeting.

403(b) Plan

The Finance and Administrative Committees discussed the issue of the presbytery's 403(b) plan, and agreed to engage a tax attorney to review the plan to determine its compliance with current tax laws.

First Presbyterian Church, Franklin / Utility Easement

The Finance Committee, in conjunction with the Administrative Committee, approved the sale of property by First Presbyterian Church, Franklin, for a utility easement. The property is in two parcels, totaling 6/100 of an acre, and will be sold to Mallory Valley Utility District for \$9,000.

Continuing Resolution

The Finance Committee recommended that effective January 1, 2020, essential expenses be paid at the 2019 budget level until the 2020 budget is approved by the Presbytery. There were no questions or discussion, and the recommendation was approved by voice vote.

Judicial Expenses – Handlson v. Presbytery of Middle Tennessee

The Rev. Sherard Edington, pastor, First Presbyterian Church, Lebanon, moved that the Finance Committee, at the February 2020 Presbytery meeting, provide a full report of all significant expenses incurred by the Presbytery in the judicial proceedings regarding the case(s) involving Pat Handlson. The motion was seconded, and Rev. Edington spoke to the motion, which was then approved by voice vote.

Recognition of Mike Ingram

Theresa Denton, chair of the Administrative Committee, asked for a point of personal privilege. She called attention to the election of a new treasurer to begin service January 1, 2020, and stated the outgoing treasurer, Mike Ingram, has served the Presbytery faithfully and well, both as a member of its Administrative and Finance Committee, Coordinating Council, Coordinating Committee, and Treasurer. Mike was elected Treasurer May 21, 1998; he has served continuously in that position with the exception of six years.

Mike has a heart for mission – new church development, disaster relief, or mission within the church or outside its bounds. Mike is also passionate about stewardship – members and churches have entrusted Presbytery with funds, and Mike has ensured the use of those funds for their intended purposes, and to further the mission of the Presbytery.

Ms. Denton spoke of Mike's calm professionalism and his work to support the integrity of the Presbytery's finances. A CPA, now retired as a partner in one of Nashville's most well-respected accounting firms, Mike is a ruling elder at Donelson Presbyterian Church, where he also serves as treasurer. Mike enjoys Tennessee Tech football, Titans football, Tennessee football, but he enjoys his grandchildren most of all.

Paul Casner, pastor of Donelson Presbyterian Church, spoke of Mike's humility. Dr. Casner reported that Mike serves others because he finds joy when others thrive. Mike's honesty, professionalism, and faith are an example to all. Dr. Casner said the Presbytery has been gifted by Mike's years of service, and he presented Mike with a plaque, a small token of Presbytery's thanks.

Mike thanked the Presbytery, and called attention to the late Charles Moore (First Nashville), the late David Cole (First Nashville), the late Wes Miller (First Franklin), and the late Joe Hutton (First Nashville), all who worked hard for the Presbytery and helped him through the years.

The Presbytery applauded Mike and gave him a standing ovation. The Moderator thanked Mike for his years of service, and his always "pessimistically optimistic" attitude.

The Moderator then offered a prayer for lunch.

The meeting was called back to order by the Moderator, who offered a prayer.

YOUTH TRIENNIUM REPORT

Linzi Anderson, Director of Youth Ministries at First Presbyterian Church, Franklin, reported on the 2019 Youth Triennium held at Purdue University. Youth from the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee joined 4,000 other youth from across the country and around the world for Triennium. Ms. Anderson spoke briefly about the event, and thanked the Presbytery for its support.

NACOME REPORT

Ryan Moore, Director of NaCoMe Camp and Conference Center, spoke about the 2019 summer camp season. Mr. Moore reported on the increase in campers, and thanked Presbytery for its support. He stated that the lowest score on the end-of-camp surveys was 97%; most scored the camp at 99% and above.

COMMITTEE ON MINISTRY REPORT

The Rev. Stephen Yates, chair of the Committee on Ministry, presented the COM's report.

2020 Committee on Ministry Leadership

The COM will recommend Elder Donna Simpson, First Cookeville, serve as chair of COM for 2020. The COM approved The Rev. Nolan Huizenga, Second, as COM vice-chair for 2020.

Moderators and Liaisons

- The Rev. Stephen Yates was approved as session moderator and liaison for Normandy Presbyterian Church.
- The Rev. Robert Montgomery was approved as liaison for Bethberei Presbyterian Church, Lewisburg.
- The Rev. Steve Thomas was approved as session moderator and liaison for Central Presbyterian Church, Culleoka.
- Elder Debbie Fraley was approved as liaison for First Presbyterian Church, Shelbyville.
- The Rev. Robert Montgomery was approved as session moderator and liaison for Belfast Presbyterian Church.

Katherine Nichols / Commissioned Pastor Training

Katherine Nichols, First Presbyterian Church, Tullahoma, met with the Examinations Task Force and endorsed for commissioned pastor training.

Pat Handlson

The COM received a six-months report from Pat Handlson, and discussed the upcoming hearing with the General Assembly Permanent Judicial Commission.

Bellevue Administrative Commission

The COM received a report from the Bellevue Administrative Commission.

Leigh Bonner / Presbytery of Greater Atlanta

The COM dismissed The Rev. Leigh Bonner to the Presbytery of Greater Atlanta, effective September 10, 2019, to accept a call.

Mark McDaniel / Presbytery of Ohio Valley

The COM dismissed The Rev. Mark McDaniel to the Presbytery of Ohio Valley, effective September 10, 2019, to accept a call.

Craig Pope / Presbytery of Savannah

The COM dismissed The Rev. Craig Pope to the Presbytery of Savannah, pending reception by that Presbytery.

Change in Voting Requirements for Calling a Pastor

The COM revised its requirements for congregational meetings to call a pastor from “vote by ballot” to add “or voice vote or show of hands.”

Katrina Olson

Katrina Olson, who is on the ordination track with the Christian Reformed Church, was approved for the Pulpit Supply List. A copy of Ms. Olson’s statement of faith and biographical statement was included with the COM report.

Jeannie Hunter / Bethberei Presbyterian Church, Lewisburg

The COM approved the temporary pastoral relationship between The Rev. Jeannie Hunter and Bethberei Presbyterian Church, Lewisburg, and approved Rev. Hunter as moderator of the session.

Jane Herring / Normandy Presbyterian Church and Belfast Presbyterian Church

The pastoral relationship between Rev. Jane Herring and Normandy Presbyterian Church was dissolved, effective September 30, 2019. Rev. Herring’s contract with Belfast Presbyterian Church will also end September 30, 2019.

Jane Herring / Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, Nashville

The Committee on Ministry sustained the examination of Rev. Jane Herring, and approved her call as part time installed pastor for Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, Nashville, effective October 15, 2019. The COM also approved the terms of call: Salary / Housing \$36,600; medical insurance - \$11,000; pension - \$4,026; death/disability insurance - \$366; four weeks of vacation; two weeks continuing education; consideration of a three month sabbatical after six years of continuous service. A copy of Rev. Herring’s statement of faith and biographical statement was included with the COM report.

Rev. Yates moved approval of the following commission to install, which was seconded and approved without objection: Sunday, October 27, 3pm, Emmanuel Presbyterian Church, Nashville; Teaching Elders – Warner Durnell (First Springfield); Evelyn Graham (Southminster); Janet Salyer (Callings Nashville); John Todd (Honorably Retired); Ruling Elders – Theresa Denton (Emmanuel); Greg Gardner (Woodland); Denny Harris (Downtown); Therese Howell (Stated Clerk); James Peeler (Harpeth); Robin Thomas (Co-Executive Presbyter).

Laura Cheifetz / Vanderbilt Divinity School

The Committee on Ministry sustained the examination of The Rev. Laura Cheifetz, a member of the Presbytery of Mid-Kentucky, who has accepted a call as Assistant Dean of Admissions, Vocation, and Stewardship at Vanderbilt Divinity School. A copy of Rev. Cheifetz’s statement of faith and biographical statement was included with the COM report. The COM received Rev. Cheifetz as a member of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee, and validated her ministry.

Ryan Moore / First Presbyterian Church, Nashville

The Committee on Ministry sustained the examination of The Rev. Dr. Ryan Moore, a member of the Presbytery of Eastern Oklahoma, who as accepted the call to serve as Pastor and Head of Staff for First Presbyterian, Nashville, effective October 21, 2019. A copy of Dr. Moore’s statement of faith and biographical statement was included with the COM report. The COM received Dr. Moore as a member of the Presbytery of Middle Tennessee, and approved the following terms of call: salary - \$177,500; housing allowance - \$50,000; cell phone allowance - \$1,200; automobile expense – IRS approved mileage rate; SECA supplement – 50% of SECA taxes on effective salary and relocation costs; continuing education - \$6,000; professional expenses - \$3,300; full medical, pension, disability, and death benefit under Board of Pensions; five weeks of vacation; two weeks of continuing education; 100% of relocation costs; assistance with down payment on house, up to 20%, in the form of a loan. The church will also grant three month sabbatical after six years of continuous full-time service.

Amy Busse Stoker / First Presbyterian Church, Pulaski

Rev. Yates stated that the Committee on Ministry had reported the approval of the call between The Rev. Amy Busse Stoker and First Presbyterian Church, Pulaski. Rev. Yates moved approval of the following commission to install, which was seconded and approved without objection: Sunday, November 3, 4PM, First Presbyterian Church, Pulaski; Teaching Elders – Sally Hughes (Trinity); Mary Louise McCullough (Second); Robert Montgomery (First Lewisburg); Stephen Yates (First Tullahoma); Ruling Elders – Jennifer Anderson (First Gallatin); Brock Birdsong (First Pulaski), chair; Guests of the Commission – Teresa Burns (First Pulaski); Rev. Jeff Obafemi Carr (Infinity Fellowship Interfaith Gathering, Nashville); Rev. Ellen Gurnon (Presbytery of Giddings-Lovejoy).

Rev. Yates asked that any new Presbytery members – Rev. Cheifetz, Rev. Cox, Dr. Gerber, Dr. Moore, and Rev. Stoker – stand and be recognized and welcomed into the Presbytery. Commissioners welcomed the new members present. Those present signed the Presbytery’s Book of Ministerial Obligations.

Kevin Whitehead / Westminster Presbyterian Church, Columbia

Rev Yates reported the COM sustained the examination of Ruling Elder Kevin Whitehead, a member of Westminster Presbyterian Church, Columbia, and recommended he be commissioned to pastoral service at Westminster Presbyterian Church, Columbia, for three years. The COM also recommends he be given the authority to moderate the session, celebrate the sacraments, and officiate at marriages, all these responsibilities at the request of the pastor and session, and have a voice and vote at presbytery (as a ruling elder for parity).

Mr. Whitehead spoke of his sense of call to Westminster Presbyterian Church, Columbia. There were no questions from the floor and the recommendation to commission Mr. Whitehead to pastoral service at Westminster Columbia was approved.

The Moderator propounded the constitutional questions to Mr. Whitehead; all were answered in the affirmative. Persons present in support of Mr. Whitehead were recognized and welcomed with applause.

Nueva Vida New Church Development

Rev. Teddy Chuquimia, organizing pastor of the Nueva Vida new church development, provided an update on the new church development. Commissioners responded with applause.

Trinity Oversight Committee Report

Ruling Elder Allen Kennedy (First Nashville), a member of the Trinity Oversight Committee, presented the committee’s report.

On October 17, 2015 Presbytery of Middle Tennessee (PMT) approved an Administrative Commission (AC) at Trinity Presbyterian Church (TPC) to assist it in dealing with a difficult and emotional, evenly-divided split between members who wished to remain at the church and those who wished to sell the church’s property, merge with another PCUSA church and use the proceeds of the sale to start new programs and ministries, the details of which were not yet fully formed. The AC decided that the plan of the “stay” members was more fully developed and that they should be allowed to execute their plan. On August 25, 2016 the AC made its final report to PMT. It recommended that TPC be monitored by an oversight committee (OC) for a three-year period to assess the church’s progress toward recovery to health and achievement of benchmarks which had been set jointly by the AC and TPC’s session. The benchmarks were intended to measure progress toward revitalization. On October 20, 2016 TPC approved the AC’s recommendation. The three-year period will end at the end of 2019.

Although many of the non-numerical benchmarks have been achieved, it is clear that the membership goal of 120 members by the end of the three-year period will not be achieved; although gradually increasing, current membership totals 66. Also, the third year (2019) goal of membership revenues of \$200,000 will not be achieved; 2019 budgeted membership revenues equals \$149,200 and is “on budget” through July. The non-

numerical goals have been substantially achieved: worship attendance exceeds 50%; revenues exceed expenses; pastoral leadership is stable and consistent; efforts are being made to recruit new members; Christian education programs are in place; mission/outreach programs are in place.

The OC has met with TPC's pastor and session multiple times. It was clear that 2017 was a year dominated by a process of grieving and recovery from the painful split. More members left than had been anticipated, which had the by-product of making achievement of membership benchmarks even more difficult. Gradually members have recovered from the trauma of the split and have begun taking positive concrete steps intended to revitalize TPC. The spirit of the membership is noticeably more upbeat, and membership is gradually increasing. A Vision Team was formed to discern a way forward; it is notable that most of the team's members were "new" to TPC, having become members since the split occurred. The Vision team identified three key areas of concentration going forward: spirituality; hospitality; partnership with Linden Waldorf School (LWS).

On August 3, 2018 TPC contracted with Center for Healthy Churches and has been actively meeting with Bill Wilson to explore ways that TPC can become a more vigorous church. Under Wilson's guidance, the team is engaged in a planning process known as "agile planning", which enables it to deal with changes in facts and circumstances as they evolve. TPC is hopeful that it will be included in a five-year program being overseen by Belmont University to assist fourteen inner-city churches in their revitalization efforts. The program will be funded by Lilly Foundation and the monetary value to each church over the five-year period is estimated to be \$40,000.

Trinity Oversight Committee – Dr. Guy Griffith (Westminster Nashville), Ruling Elder Phil Martin (First Nashville), Ruling Elder Allen Kennedy (First Nashville)

Mr. Kennedy stated the Oversight Committee had the following four recommendations, and he moved approval of all four:

1. Trinity Presbyterian Church has requested that it be given the latitude to "embark on a five-year strategy which will build up the body of Christ in its current location, and maximize the use of the church building and grounds to the glory of God and the benefit of the neighborhood."
2. They recommend that Presbytery of Middle Tennessee's involvement at Trinity Presbyterian Church be overseen by its current Co-Executive Presbyters, Robin and Ray Thomas. The members of the Oversight Committee believe that it is in the best interest of both Trinity Presbyterian Church and Presbytery of Middle Tennessee to approve Trinity's request.
3. The Oversight Committee recommends that it be dissolved.
4. It further recommends that Trinity Presbyterian Church furnish regular reports to appropriate Presbytery of Middle Tennessee committees that update its progress toward revitalization.

After discussion, the recommendations were approved as presented.

CO-EXECUTIVE PRESBYTERS REPORT

Robin and Ray Thomas presented a report. They thanked Second Nashville for hosting the October Presbytery meeting. The Co-Executive Presbyters have been busy! They reported on their work in the six months they have been board, and upcoming events in the Presbytery.

The Co-Executives then led the Presbytery in a time of sharing concerns, celebrations, and announcements.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

The Moderator stated there was no unfinished business, and reported the 140th Stated Meeting would be Saturday, February 1, 2020, at First Presbyterian Church, Tullahoma. The meeting adjourned at 1:30pm upon motion made, seconded, and approved without objection after a prayer by the Moderator.

Therese P. Howell, Stated Clerk